

Stewardship•Integrity•Excellence

## Review of Commonwealth Debt and Debt Capacity

A Briefing for the Senate Finance \& Appropriations Capital Outlay and Transportation Subcommittee

David Richardson<br>State Treasurer<br>January 12, 2024

## Overview

- Commonwealth Debt
- Issuers
- Constitutional Framework
- Debt Overview - 9(b), 9(c), and 9(d) Debt
- Amounts Outstanding, Authorized and Issued
- Debt Capacity
- Background
- Model
- December 2023 Recommendation


## Debt Overview - Issuers

- The following are the primary tax-supported* debt issuing boards and authorities:
- Treasury Board - General Obligation (GO)
- Virginia College Building Authority (VCBA)
- Virginia Public Building Authority (VPBA)
- Commonwealth Transportation Board (CTB)
- Virginia Port Authority (VPA)
- The following authorities currently issue moral obligation or sum-sufficient appropriation bonds:
- Virginia Resources Authority (VRA)
- Virginia Public School Authority (VPSA)


## Debt Overview - Framework of Article X of Constitution

| Type | Purpose | G.A. Action | Referendum | Security | Issuer |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 9(a) | Emergencies, Deficits, Redeem Prior Obligations | General <br> Authorization | No | GO | Treasury Board |
| 9(b) | Capital Projects | Specific Project Authorization | Yes | GO | Treasury Board |
| 9(c) | Revenue <br> Producing <br> Capital Projects | 2/3 Majority <br> Project <br> Authorization | No | Revenues +GO | Treasury Board |
| 9(d) | Anything Else | General Authorization | No | Revenues/ Appropriations | Agencies Authorities Institutions |

## Debt Overview - 9(b) and 9(c) Debt

- 9(b) General Obligation Debt
- Requires authorization by General Assembly and approval of voters at a referendum
- Secured by full faith and credit of the Commonwealth (G.O. Pledge)
- Paid by general fund revenues
- Impacts debt capacity
- AAA/Aaa/AAA ratings provide lowest interest rates
- Last voter approved referendum 2002
- 9(c) General Obligation Debt
- Revenue producing projects (eg. dorm, dining and toll roads)
- Paid by revenues from project, but backed by Commonwealth's G.O. Pledge
- AAA/Aaa/AAA ratings provide lowest interest rates
- Tax-supported debt, but not included in debt capacity model, doesn’t impact debt capacity


## Debt Overview - 9(d) Debt

- 9(d) Appropriation-Backed Debt (eg. VCBA 21 ${ }^{\text {st }}$ Century Program and VPBA)
- Higher Education \& General state projects
- Secured by appropriations from the general fund
- Slightly higher interest rates due to appropriation-backed security (AA+/Aa1/AA+ ratings)
- Tax-supported debt; included in debt capacity model, impacts debt capacity
- 9(d) Higher Education Debt
- Eligible for all project types
- May be issued by institution or through VCBA Pooled Bond Program
- Secured by general revenues of higher education institution
- Not considered tax-supported debt


## Debt Overview - Outstanding Tax-Supported Debt by Category

Fiscal Years 2014-2023 ${ }^{1}$


## Debt Overview - Tax-Supported Debt Authorizations vs. Issuances

Fiscal Years 2014-2023


## Debt Overview - Uses of Tax-Supported Debt

Fiscal Years 2014-2023
Ten-Year Total = \$10.23 Billion


## Virginia's Tax-Supported Debt Compared to Other States



## Virginia's Tax-Supported Debt Compared to Other States



## Debt Capacity Advisory Committee (DCAC) Background

- The Committee's general mandate is:
- Annually review the size and condition of the Commonwealth's tax-supported debt
- Submit to the Governor and the General Assembly before January 1, an estimate of the maximum amount of new tax-supported debt that prudently may be authorized for the next biennium (Section 2.2-2714 Code of Virginia). This estimate is advisory and in no way binds the Governor or the General Assembly
- Annually review the amount and condition of moral obligation debt and other debt for which the Commonwealth has a contingent or limited liability
- Review the amount and condition of Commonwealth obligations that are not general obligations or moral obligations


## DCAC Background - Importance of Measuring Debt Affordability

- Debt affordability is a key factor assessed by rating agencies
- Attempts to correlate the borrowing for capital needs with the ability to repay
- Issuance above capacity can cause erosion in credit rating
- Most states perform a debt affordability or capacity calculation


## DCAC Background - Importance of AAA Bond Rating

- Commonwealth has held a AAA general obligation bond rating from Moody's since 1938, Standard and Poor's since 1962 and Fitch since 1991
- Subject-to-appropriation bonds are rated one notch below the state's GO rating at AA+ (Includes: VCBA 21st Century, VPBA, CTB)
- Bond investors willing to accept lower rate of interest for high credit quality
- Demand for credit quality is high
- Stock market volatility and global markets unrest resulted in flight to quality
- Reduced reliance on bond insurers make "natural" AAA's/AA's more valuable
- Portfolio managers need highly-rated bonds to improve fund profile


## Debt Capacity Model - Measure and Inputs

- In order to preserve the Commonwealth's ability to provide core government services, debt service should be limited to an appropriate level
- DCAC adopted the measure that debt service on tax-supported debt should not be greater than $5 \%$ of blended revenues
- Committee has reaffirmed this measure each year
- Recommendation is expressed in terms of a ten-year average
- Blended revenues include:
- General Fund Revenues
- General Fund Transfers - ABC, Sales Tax, Recurring Transfers
- Virginia Health Care Fund
- Transportation Trust Fund (TTF)


## Debt Capacity Model - Measure and Inputs (Continued)

- Tax-supported debt included in Debt Capacity Model:
- Debt for which debt service payments are made or pledged to be made from funds derived from state-wide tax revenues
- 9(b) General Obligation
- 9(d) VCBA ( $21^{\text {st }}$ Century and Equipment), VPBA, VPA, and CTB debt secured by the TTF
- Certain long-term leases and subscription-based IT arrangements, installment purchases and miscellaneous debt
- Debt not included in Debt Capacity Model:
- 9(c) G.O. since payments are to be paid by project revenues
- Debt/Notes of Institutions of Higher Education supported by General Revenues of the Institution
- Moral Obligation issued by VRA
- Sum-Sufficient Appropriation issued by VPSA
- Grant Anticipation Revenue Vehicles ("GARVEES")


## Debt Capacity Model - Measure and Inputs (Continued)

- All scheduled debt service on outstanding tax-supported debt is included in the model
- Estimated debt service on authorized but unissued debt is included in model and is based on:
- Information from agencies
- Short-term interest rates
- Long-term interest rates
- Debt service on proposed new debt in Governor's Budget is NOT included in the model


## Debt Capacity Model - Measure and Inputs (Continued)

- The Model Interest Rate is based on the average of the last 12 quarters of the Bond Buyer 11 Index for G.O. debt and 25 bps is added for 9(d) debt
- As of the December 21, 2023 DCAC Report, the Model Interest Rate was $2.80 \%$ for G.O. bonds and $3.05 \%$ for 9(d) bonds
- Due to unprecedented rate increases in calendar years 2022 and 2023, the Model Interest Rate significantly lagged current market rates
- A Recommended Modified Model Rate of $4.75 \%$ for 9 (d) bonds was adopted by the DCAC Committee in making its debt capacity recommendation
- Treasury Staff consulted with financial advisors and the Secretary of Finance to determine a conservative Recommended Modified Model Rate to recommend to the Committee
- The Federal Reserve has increased interest rates by 525 basis points since March of 2022
- The Bond Buyer 11 Index yield for G.O. bonds in early November 2023 at 4.1\%, but has since declined more than 75 basis points and was at $3.3 \%$ as of December 7, 2023


## Debt Capacity Model - Currently Authorized \& Unissued Debt

## As of June 30, 2023

(Dollars in Millions)

| VPBA | \$ | $1,403.7$ |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| VCBA |  | $1,101.7$ |
| Transportation - CPR | 146.6 |  |
| Transportation - NVTD * | 24.7 |  |
| Transportation - Route 58 | 226.4 |  |
| VPA |  |  |
|  | $\$$ | $2,903.1$ |

## Debt Capacity Model - Factors Affecting Debt Capacity

- Revisions to revenue estimates
- Driven by economy
- Policy changes
- Authorization of additional tax-supported debt
- Changes to issuance assumptions
- Actual financing dates/terms vs. estimated
- Revisions to project spending schedules
- Changes in interest rates


## December 2023 Model $^{1}$

(Dollars in Millions)

| Fiscal Year | Blended <br> Revenues | Amount of <br> Additional <br> Debt that may <br> Be Issued | Total <br> Debt Service as a \% of Revenues |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2024 | 30,364.06 | 0.00 | 4.71\% |
| 2025 | 32,625.82 | 1,058.96 | 4.82\% |
| 2026 | 33,549.77 | 1,058.96 | 5.01\% |
| 2027 | 34,993.01 | 1,058.96 | 4.97\% |
| 2028 | 36,235.75 | 1,058.96 | 4.92\% |
| 2029 | 37,103.26 | 1,058.96 | 4.89\%... |
| 2030 | 38,408.22 | 1,058.96 | 4.78\% |
| 2031 | 39,733.07 | 1,058.96 | 4.64\% |
| 2032 | 41,132.99 | 1,058.96 | 4.53\% |
| 2033 | 42,559.28 | 1,058.96 | 4.43\% |

(1) A summary portion of the Model is shown above. A more complete view is shown in the Appendix.


## Committee's December 2023 Recommendation

- Up to an additional \$1.06 billion could prudently be authorized and issued during each of fiscal years 2024 and 2025
- Committee noted the Commonwealth's fiscal strength entering 2024, but also noted that material changes to the Commonwealth's revenues or to the prevailing interest rate would impact the Commonwealth's debt capacity
- Committee urged the Governor and the General Assembly to continue to use caution when considering future tax-supported debt authorizations
- Virginia's debt burden has increased significantly over the last 10 years
- Nearly $\$ 3$ billion in authorized but unissued tax-supported debt
- Rising construction costs and higher interest rates may require additional funding for previously authorized capital projects
- Committee recognized the Commonwealth's substantial cash contributions in recent fiscal years to address funding shortfalls for existing capital projects


## How Does the DCAC Recommendation Impact Authorizations?

- Recommendation is non-binding, but is taken into consideration by the Governor and the General Assembly when developing the budget
- Available debt capacity may constrain the ability to finance capital needs
- Previously authorized projects can be delayed, rescinded, or adjusted to impact the timing and amount of debt service


## Introduced 2024-2026 Budget - Impact on DCAC Model

- Approximately $\$ 503.2$ million of proposed new tax-supported debt is included in the Governor's proposed 2024-2026 biennium budget
- $\$ 334.9$ million of VCBA/VCBA appropriation supported bond authorization
- $\$ 168.3$ million of VCBA higher-education equipment trust fund bond authorization
- If the additional debt service related to the proposed new debt in the budget is included in the DCAC model, the debt capacity would decline by $\$ 42$ million annually to $\$ 1.02$ billion


# Appendix <br> Description of Types of Debt 

| Types of State Bonded Debt | Primary Security | Rating (Moody's, Fitch) | Typical Purpose | Authorization Required | Debt Capacity | Typical term |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| General Obligation Bonds |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| GO-9(b) Voter-approved GO's | GF | Aaa/AAA/AAA | Capital | GA + voters | Yes | 20 |
| GO-9(c) Project revenues + GO pledge | NGF/Auxiliary, Tolls + GO backstop | Aaa/AAA/AAA | Revenue-producing capital (dorm, dining, parking) | GA + Feasibility | No (1) | 20-30 |
| Subject to Appropriation/Revenue Bonds |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| VCBA 21st Century Program | GF | Aa1/AA + AA + | Capital - E\&G, Maint Reserve | GA | Yes | 20 |
| VCBA Equipment Trust Fund | GF | Aa1/AA + /AA + | Educational/Research Equipment | GA | Yes | 7 |
| VPBA | GF | Aa1/AA $+/ \mathrm{AA}+$ | Capital - Maint Reserve, regional jails, water quality/ stormwater grants | GA | Yes | 20 |
| Other 9(d) Debt |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| VCBA Higher Ed Projects | NGF-General Revenue <br> Pledge + State aid intercept | Aa1/AA/AA+ | Capital - Rec/sports facilities, Athletic, Convocation, etc. | GA | No | 20-30 |
| College/ University Higher Ed Projects | NGF-General or specific revenue pledge | Varies | Capital - Rec/sports facilities, dormitories, athletic, Convocation, etc. | GA (except Level 3's) | No | 20-30 |
| Long-term leases, support agreements | NGF-General or specific revenue pledge | Varies | Capital - dormitory, multi-use facilities | GA (except Level 3's) | No | 20-30 |

## Appendix <br> December 2023 Model ${ }^{*}$

## (Dollars in Millions)

| Fiscal Year | Blended <br> Revenues | Base <br> Capacity <br> to Pay <br> Debt Service | Annual <br> Payments for Debt Service <br> on Debt Issued | Actual <br> Outstanding <br> Debt Service <br> as a \% of <br> Revenues | Annual <br> Payments for Debt Service on All Planned Debt Issuances |  <br> Projected <br> Debt Service <br> as a \% of <br> Revenues | Net <br> Capacity <br> to Pay <br> Debt Service | Amount of Additional Debt that may Be Issued | Debt Service on Amount of Additional Debt that may Be Issued | Remaining <br> Capacity <br> to Pay <br> Debt Service | Total <br> Debt Service as a \% of Revenues |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2024 | 30,364.06 | 1,518.20 | 1,233.69 | 4.06\% | 195.38 | 4.71\% | 89.14 | 0.00 | 0.000 | 89.14 | 4.71\% |
| 2025 | 32,625.82 | 1,631.29 | 1,196.11 | 3.67\% | 295.21 | 4.57\% | 139.97 | 1,058.96 | 81.299 | 58.67 | 4.82\% |
| 2026 | 33,549.77 | 1,677.49 | 1,155.43 | 3.44\% | 362.41 | 4.52\% | 159.65 | 1,058.96 | 162.591 | (2.94) | 5.01\% |
| 2027 | 34,993.01 | 1,749.65 | 1,101.21 | 3.15\% | 393.12 | 4.27\% | 255.32 | 1,058.96 | 243.887 | 11.43 | 4.97\% |
| 2028 | 36,235.75 | 1,811.79 | 1,039.02 | 2.87\% | 420.27 | 4.03\% | 352.50 | 1,058.96 | 325.183 | 27.31 | 4.92\% |
| 2029 | 37,103.26 | 1,855.16 | 986.79 | 2.66\% | 420.27 | 3.79\% | 448.10 | 1,058.96 | 406.478 | 41.62 | 4.89\% |
| 2030 | 38,408.22 | 1,920.41 | 926.78 | 2.41\% | 420.27 | 3.51\% | 573.36 | 1,058.96 | 487.774 | 85.59 | 4.78\% |
| 2031 | 39,733.07 | 1,986.65 | 853.17 | 2.15\% | 420.27 | 3.21\% | 713.21 | 1,058.96 | 569.070 | 144.14 | 4.64\% |
| 2032 | 41,132.99 | 2,056.65 | 808.38 | 1.97\% | 405.90 | 2.95\% | 842.37 | 1,058.96 | 650.366 | 192.01 | 4.53\% |
| 2033 | 42,559.28 | 2,127.96 | 746.52 | 1.75\% | 405.90 | 2.71\% | 975.55 | 1,058.96 | 731.661 | 243.89 | 4.43\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10 Year <br> Average: | \$1,058.96 |  |  |  |

